SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO CENTRAL

MINUTE ORDER

DATE: 03/02/2023

TIME: 09:00:00 AM

DEPT: C-64

JUDICIAL OFFICER PRESIDING: John S. Meyer CLERK: Natalie Calantoc, Herlinda Chavarin REPORTER/ERM: Brianna Haro CSR# 13121 BAILIFF/COURT ATTENDANT: S. Green

CASE NO: 37-2018-00023369-CU-PO-CTL CASE INIT.DATE: 05/11/2018 CASE TITLE: Christopher Williams vs David Arambula [IMAGED] CASE CATEGORY: Civil - Unlimited CASE TYPE: PI/PD/WD - Other

EVENT TYPE: Civil Jury Trial

APPEARANCES

Cory J Briggs, counsel, present for Plaintiff(s). CHRISTOPHER WILLIAMS, Plaintiff is present. Kimberly S Oberrecht, counsel, present for Defendant(s). Emily Straub, counsel, present for Defendant(s). David Arambula, Defendant is present. Nora Pasin, counsel, present for petitioner Kathryn Colgan, counsel, present for defendant

9:00 am REPORTED and out of the presence of the jury, with plaintiff(s), defendant(s) and counsel present as noted above. The Court and counsel discuss petitioner's counsel not wanting to disclose to the jury that defendant's fiance has passed away. Counsel is to tell the jury that defendant's fiance is unavailable. Court and Counsel discuss witness and jury watching the video.

9:10 am This being the time previously set for further Jury trial in the above entitled cause, having been continued from 03/01/2023, all parties and counsel appear as noted above and court convenes. All jurors are present

9:13 am DAVID ARAMBULA, called pursuant to Evidence Code 776, is sworn and examined by Attorney Cory Briggs on behalf of petitioner Christopher Williams.

10:25 am All jurors are admonished and excused for break and Court is in recess.

10:48 am Court reconvenes with plaintiff(s), defendant(s) and counsel present as noted above. All jurors are present.

10:49 am DAVID ARAMBULA, previously sworn, resumes the stand for further cross examination by Attorney Cory Briggs on behalf of plaintiff, Christopher Williams.

11:01 am Direct examination of DAVID ARAMBULA commences by Attorney Kathryn Colgan on behalf of defendant, David Arambula.

11:22 am The Court takes a brief recess to allow the witness to take a bathroom break. Counsel and Jurors remain in the courtroom.

11:24 am Witness returns to the courtroom. Direct examination of DAVID ARAMBULA resumes by Attorney Kathryn Colgan on behalf of defendant, David Arambula.

11:31 am Cross examination of DAVID ARAMBULA commences by Attorney Kimberly Oberrecht on behalf of defendant, City of Lemon Grove.

11:44 am Recross examination of DAVID ARAMBULA commences by Attorney Cory Briggs on behalf of plaintiff, Christopher WIIIiams.

11:51 am Redirect examination of DAVID ARAMBULA commences by Attorney Kathryn Colgan on behalf of defendant, David Arambula.

11:52 am Recross examination of DAVID ARAMBULA commences by Attorney Cory Briggs on behalf of plaintiff, Christopher Williams.

11:52 am All jurors are admonished and excused for lunch and Court remains in session.

11:54 am Court is in session, REPORTED and out of the presence of the jury, with plaintiff(s), defendant(s) and counsel present as noted above. The Court and counsel discuss witness and trial time estimates.

11:58 am Court is in recess.

Clerk's Note: 1:15 pm H. Chavarin assumes the duties of courtroom clerk.

1:26 pm Out of the presence of the jury, the court states it has reviewed the Jury Instructions and Complaint and it finds there is no negligence cause of action. Attorney Briggs states he will confer with his client regarding dismissing the negligence cause of action claim.

1:32 pm Court is in recess.

1:32 pm Court reconvenes with plaintiff(s), defendant(s) and counsel present as noted above. All jurors are present.

1:34 pm LYDIA ROMERO, called pursuant to Evidence Code 776, is sworn and examined by Attorney Briggs on behalf of plaintiff Christopher Williams.

1:41 pm Direct examination of LYDIA ROMERO commences by Attorney Oberrecht on behalf of defendant, City of Lemon Grove.

1:41 pm Recross examination of LYDIA ROMERO commences by Attorney Briggs on behalf of plaintiff, Christopher Williams.

1:42 pm A REPORTED hallway conference is held until 1:45 pm and thereafter testimony of LYDIA ROMERO resumes.

1:46 pm The witness is excused.

1:46 pm Plaintiff rests subject to the admission of exhibits.

1:47 pm RACQUEL VASQUEZ is sworn and examined by Attorney Straub on behalf of defendant, David Arambula.

2:15 pm Cross examination of RACQUEL VASQUEZ commences by Attorney Oberrecht on behalf of defendant, City of Lemon Grove.

2:21 pm Cross examination of RACQUEL VASQUEZ commences by Attorney Briggs on behalf of plaintiff, Christopher Williams.

2:37 pm The witness is excused.

2:37 pm Attorney Straub informs the court the excerpts of the videotaped deposition of Alma Velasquez will be played. Upon the court's inquiry, counsel waive reporting.

2:41 pm UNREPORTED, Excerpts of the videotaped deposition testimony of ALMA VELASQUEZ are presented in lieu of live testimony. The transcript of the videotaped deposition of Alma Velasquez is identified and marked as Court's Exhibit **309**. A copy of the transcript is attached hereto and incorporated herein. (5 minutes)

2:46 pm Defendants rests subject to the admission of exhibits.

The court informs the jury evidence has concluded. In the presence of the jury, the court inquires of counsel regarding time estimate of their closing arguments.

2:48 pm All jurors are admonished and excused for the evening and Court remains in session.

Out of the presence of the jury, the court instructs Attorney Briggs to speak with his client regarding the negligence cause of action.

The court and counsel discuss Attorney Oberrecht's Motion for Non-Suit and plaintiff filing an opposition. Attorney Briggs states he will deliver plaintiff's opposition to the motion tomorrow morning.

Attorney Oberrecht makes an oral Motion for Directed Verdict.

The court states it will take a brief recess to allow Attorney Briggs to speak with his client; thereafter the court and counsel will review jury instructions.

2:50 pm Court is in recess.

3:14 pm Court reconvenes with counsel present as noted above. Out of the presence of the jury, Attorney Briggs in forms the court his client will dismiss the Third Cause of Action for Negligence.

The court and counsel discuss the Verdict Form.

3:25 pm Court is in recess.

3:29 pm Court reconvenes with counsel present as noted above. The court reviews jury instructions proposed by counsel.

The court reviews special instructions proposed by defendant, City of Lemon Grove and hears argument by counsel.

The court and counsel discuss defendant's net worth evidence in the event the jury finds punitive damages.

The court states it is inclined to deny the Motion for Non-Suit. The court hears argument by counsel on the motion. The court having heard argument by counsel, reserves ruling on the motion at this time.

4:07 pm Court is in recess.

4:08 pm Court is adjourned until 03/06/2023 at 09:00AM in Department 64.

Case Clips Detailed Report Williams v. Arambula

VELASQUEZ, ALMA - VOL 1 - 10/22/2019 1 Clips (Running 00:04:39.438)

AV-1022-006005 (Running 00:04:39.438)

In Lieu - Alma Velasquez

1. Page 06:05 to 06:09 (Running 00:00:13.390)

- 06:05 BY MR. BRIGGS:
 - 06 Q Good morning. Would you please state and
 - 07 spell your name for the record.
 - 80 A Alma Velasquez. Alma is spelled A-L-M-A.
 - 09 Velasquez is "V" as in Victor, E-L-A-S-Q-U-E-Z.

2. Page 11:19 to 11:25 (Running 00:00:17.580)

- 11:19 Do you know someone named David Arambula?
 - 20 A Yes.
 - 21 Q How do you know Mr. Arambula?
 - 22 A He is my fiance.
 - 23 Q Okay. How long have you been fiance?
 - 24 A We got engaged approximately December
 - 25 of 2017.

3. Page 12:03 to 12:04 (Running 00:00:10.720)

- Q Okay. How long have you known each other? 12:03
 - A I was introduced 2016. 04

4. Page 12:19 to 12:24 (Running 00:00:08.430)

- Q Okay. You and Mr. Arambula live together 12:19
 - 20 currently?
 - 21 A Yes.
 - 22 Q Is that at 2811 Skyline Drive in Lemon
 - 23 Grove?
 - 24 A Yes.

5. Page 15:08 to 15:11 (Running 00:00:10.460)

- Q Are you aware that there was an incident 15:08
 - between my client and Mr. Arambula the evening of 09
 - July 14, 2017, at his house? 10
 - A Yes. 11

6. Page 15:14 to 15:17 (Running 00:00:05.968)

- 15:14 Q Were you at his house that evening?
 - 15 A No.
 - 16 Q Okay. How did you become aware of the

Court's Ex. 309
Case # 2018 - 23369
Rec'd
Dept <u>64</u> _Clk

Total Number of Clips: 1

Total Number of Segments: 9

15:17 incident?

7. Page 15:23 to 15:23 (Running 00:00:01.200)

15:23 THE WITNESS: He called me.

8. Page 17:02 to 17:09 (Running 00:00:15.930)

- 17:02 Q Okay. So after the incident, when was the
 - 03 first time that David called you, Mr. Arambula called
 - 04 you?
 - 05 A Approximately about 30 to 40 minutes after
 - 06 it happened.
 - 07 Q Okay. And so would that have been about
 - 08 12:30 a.m. on July 15?
 - 09 A Approximately, yes.

9. Page 24:20 to 28:22 (Running 00:03:15.760)

24:20 Q Okay. Did you end up seeing Mr. Arambula

- 21 later that night, July 15 of 2017?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q Okay. About what time did you see him?
- 24 A Approximately 7:30 to 8:00 p.m.
- 25 Q Okay. Did you see any bruises on his body?
- 25:01 A Yes.
 - 02 Q Where?
 - 03 A His hands.
 - 04 Q Okay. What bruises did you see on his
 - 05 hands?
 - 06 A Knuckle -- the knuckle area --
 - 07 Q Okay.
 - 08 A -- was swollen on both hands.
 - 09 Q Okay.
 - 10 A More so on the right hand.
 - 11 Q Okay. Is his right hand his dominant hand?
 - 12 A Yes.
 - 13 Q Did you see any cuts on his body?
 - 14 A No.
 - 15 Q Did you see any injuries to his face?
 - 16 A No.
 - 17 Q Did you see any injuries to his neck?
 - 18 A Not at that time.
 - 19 Q Did you at some point later in time see

Total Number of Clips: 1

Total Number of Segments: 9

25:20 injuries to his neck?

- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Okay. Did you see any injuries to his legs?
- 23 A No.
- 24 Q Any injuries to his chest?
- 25 A Yes.

26:01 Q Did you see any injuries to his back?

- 02 A No.
- 03 Q Okay. So when you get there on July 15, in
- 04 addition to seeing his knuckles bruised and the right
- 05 hand more so than the left, what injuries did you see
- 06 to his chest?
- 07 A At that time I did not see any injuries on
- 08 his chest.
- 09 Q Okay. When after that first time you saw
- 10 him, when did you then see chest injuries?
- 11 A When we went home that night.
- 12 Q Okay.
- 13 A So the night, probably around 11:00 p.m.,
- 14 and he started undressing.
- 15 Q Okay. So is it fair to say that you met him
- 16 the evening of July 15 somewhere other than home?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Where did you meet?
- 19 A I don't recall the venue, but it was at his
- 20 friend's James Elia's wedding.
- 21 Q Okay.
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q So at a wedding, unless it's a really fun
- 24 wedding, you probably wouldn't see his chest or --
- 25 A No.
- 27:01 Q So then you get home that evening, and then
 - 02 you see an injury to his chest; is that right?
 - 03 A Yes.
 - 04 Q What did you see?
 - 05 A Some bruising.
 - 06 Q Okay.
 - 07 A Very light bruising around his -- his neck

Total Number of Clips: 1

Total Number of Segments: 9

27:08 and chest.

- 09 Q Okay. Now, I think you mentioned that you
- 10 also saw a neck injury.
- 11 Was that the same bruising?
- 12 A No. That's separate.
- 13 Q Okay. So you saw light bruising.
- 14 Any other injuries that you saw?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q No cuts?
- 17 A No.
- 18 Q No scrapes?
- 19 A No.
- 20 Q Okay. What injuries did you see to his
- 21 neck?
- 22 A Just a faint bruising.
- 23 Q Okay.
- 24 A Like around his neck -
- 25 Q So --
- 28:01 A -- in this area here.
 - 02 Q So is it fair to say that roughly from
 - 03 Adam's apple to sternum, you saw some light bruising?
 - 04 A No. It wasn't one injury. It was separate.
 - 05 So he had bruising on his chest area --
 - 06 Q Okay.
 - 07 A -- and then bruising around his neck.
 - 08 Q Okay. So you're -
 - 09 A So it wasn't continuous.
 - 10 Q You're pointing to your breastbone below
 - 11 your clavicle?
 - 12 A Yeah, chest.
 - 13 Q And then you're pointing to your -- bottom
 - 14 of your neck, lower part of your neck, yes?
 - 15 A Yes.
 - 16 Q Okay. Any other injuries that you saw on
 - 17 him?
 - 18 A No.
 - 19 Q Okay. So you initially see bruising to the
 - 20 knuckles. And then when you get home, you see the

Total Number of Clips: 1

Total Number of Segments: 9

- 28:21 light bruising, chest and neck; is that right?
 - 22 A Yes.

.

Total Number of Clips: 1

Total Number of Segments: 9

Total Running Time: 00:04:39.438

. .